Meta-Analysis of Bushen Huoxue Method in the Treatment of Recurrent Spontaneous Abortion Due to Prethrombotic State

Rong-Feng Pu¹, Nan Li², Hong-Li Zhu², Jun Bai², Mei Chen²*

¹Shaanxi University of Chinese Medicine, Xianyang 712000, China
²Affiliated Hospital of Shaanxi University of Chinese Medicine, Xianyang 712000, China

*Corresponding author: Mei Chen, mmchen2009@126.com

Abstract: Objective: To evaluate the effectiveness and safety of Bushen Huoxue prescription in the treatment of recurrent spontaneous abortion (RSA) due to prethrombotic state (PTS). Methods: Databases such as CNKI, WanFang, VIP, CBM, PubMed, Embase, and Cochrane Library were searched for randomized controlled trials on Bushen Huoxue prescription in treating RSA due to PTS from inception to March 2021; meta-analysis was performed by RevMan Version 5.3.0 following quality evaluation. Results: Seven trials were included, with 496 patients; the meta-analysis indicated that Bushen Huoxue prescription has advantages on the improvement of total clinical effective rate [RR = 1.22, 95% CI (1.10, 1.35), Z = 3.80 (P = 0.0001)], embryo survival rate at pregnancy of 12 weeks [RR = 1.25, 95% CI (1.10, 1.41), Z = 3.53 (P = 0.0004)], D-dimer levels [SMD = -1.59, 95% CI (-2.20, -0.97), Z = 5.07 (P < 0.00001)], and fibrinogen levels [MD = -1.00, 95% CI (-1.29, -0.70), Z = 6.61 (P < 0.00001)], but the statistical heterogeneity was significant; in terms of incidence of adverse reactions, there was no statistical difference between Bushen Huoxue prescription and western medicine. Conclusion: Compared with western medicine alone, Bushen Huoxue prescription alone or in combination with western medicine showed significant advantages in improving the overall clinical efficiency, embryonic survival rate at 12 weeks of pregnancy, and reducing D-dimer values as well as fibrinogen levels, without any significant difference in the incidence of adverse effects; however, the number of included studies is small and there are drawbacks, such as small sample size and low quality; therefore, high-quality clinical studies with large sample size and rigorous trial designs are needed in the future to provide a reliable basis for the effectiveness and safety of TCM in reducing the incidence of RSA due to prethrombotic state.

Keywords: Bushen Huoxue method; Recurrent spontaneous abortion; Prethrombotic state; Systematic review; Meta-analysis

Online publication: March 24, 2022

1. Introduction
Recurrent spontaneous abortion (RSA) plagues approximately 2-5% of women during the reproductive age, and its incidence has been on the rise in recent years [1,2], causing great concern among researchers in the field of reproduction at home and abroad. At present, there is a lack of unified standard on the definition of RSA worldwide [3]. The latest expert consensus in China suggests defining RSA as two or more consecutive spontaneous abortions (SA) or biochemical pregnancies [4]. Pregnant women are in a hypercoagulable state [5,6], which can evolve into a prethrombotic state (PTS) when the physiological dynamic balance of coagulation, anticoagulation, and fibrinolytic mechanisms is disrupted by changes in the internal environment of the body. Studies have shown that PTS is associated with RSA [7], and this has become a
hot research area in recent years because of its insidious clinical symptoms and unclear diagnostic criteria\[8\]. The treatment with low molecular heparin and aspirin has been used empirically in modern medicine, but there is a lack of strong evidence in terms of its therapeutic effect and improvement in pregnancy outcomes; in addition, its continuous treatment and research are costly, thus bringing challenges to the prevention and treatment of recurrent miscarriage\[9-11\]. PTS is compatible with “blood stasis” in TCM, and Professor Luo Songping suggested that the treatment for it should be based on Bushen Huoxue\[12\]. Literature has shown that Bushen Huoxue prescription can improve the coagulation index and regulate microcirculation in patients with RSA, which has a positive effect on the preservation of fetus in early pregnancy\[13-15\].

In recent years, the treatment of this disease with Bushen Huoxue prescription has attracted the attention of researchers, but there is a lack of systematic evaluation analysis on the treatment of RSA with this prescription. In this study, a meta-analysis is carried out to evaluate the effectiveness and safety of Bushen Huoxue prescription in the treatment of RSA due to PTS according to the relevant published literatures.

2. Data and methods
2.1. Inclusion criteria
(1) Randomized controlled clinical studies; (2) all subjects included were patients with confirmed diagnosis of RSA, and clear diagnostic criteria were mentioned in the literatures in accordance to the Chinese Expert Consensus on the Diagnosis and Treatment of Spontaneous Abortion (2020 version)\[4\]: 2 or more consecutive SAs, Chinese medicine evidence of “kidney deficiency and blood stasis,” as well as blood tests consistent with prethrombotic state; (3) clear therapeutic measures, where the experimental group was treated with Bushen Huoxue prescription or Bushen Huoxue prescription combined with western medicine, while the control group was treated with western medicine, without any limitations in the dose and duration of treatment; (4) the outcome indexes included total clinical efficiency, embryonic survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation, D-dimer levels, fibrinogen (Fib) levels, and incidence of adverse effects.

2.2. Exclusion criteria
(1) The diagnosis and exclusion criteria of the included cases were missing or unclear; (2) interventions were not clearly written to Bushen Huoxue or the herbal medicine was not mainly Bushen Huoxue; (3) the control group was treated with Chinese herbal medicine; (4) the content data is not exhaustive or missing, and the quality is relatively poor.

2.3. Search strategy
A computer search of CNKI, VIP, WanFang, CBM, and PubMed databases was carried out from inception to March 2021 for published clinical research literatures on PTS in RSA patients according to the cubic method of Bushen Huoxue. The following Chinese search terms (English translation) were used: (recurrent spontaneous abortion), (prethrombotic state), (Bushen Huoxue), (traditional Chinese medicine), (Chinese medicine), and similarly, the following English search terms were used: “recurrent spontaneous abortion,” “recurrent abortion,” “prethrombotic state,” “Bushen Huoxue,” “Chinese herbal,” and “traditional Chinese medicine.” The search was conducted using a combination of subject terms and free words. In addition, the references of the included studies and related reviews were traced back and hand-searched to ensure that no literatures meeting the inclusion criteria were omitted.
2.4. Data collection and analysis

2.4.1. Literature screening and data extraction
Initial screening was performed by reading the title and abstract of each literature, and then the full text of the literature to screen those that met the inclusion criteria. Study data were extracted, including basic information (author, title, year of publication, and sample size), baseline status of the subjects, interventions and outcome index data, etc. The extracted data were organized using Excel. The above links were completed independently by 2 researchers, and a third-party opinion was referred to in case of disagreement.

2.4.2. Literature quality assessment
A literature quality assessment was performed to identify the bias and reliability of the results according to the risk of bias tool recommended in Cochrane Handbook 5.1.0 [16]. Seven items were evaluated, including how the randomized allocation sequence was generated, whether the allocation scheme was reasonably concealed, whether the subjects and healthcare providers were double-blinded, whether the outcome assessors were blinded, the completeness of the outcome data, whether the results were selectively reported, and whether there were other biases. Judgments were made for each study.

3. Results
3.1. Literature search results
The initial search yielded 279 articles; 149 duplicated articles were excluded with 130 articles remaining. Upon reading the title and abstract, 104 articles were excluded with 26 articles remaining, and 19 articles were excluded after reading the full text, thus resulting in the inclusion of seven articles (Figure 1).

Figure 1. Literature search results
3.2. Basic characteristics of the included studies

The seven included studies were all RCTs with a sample size of 496 cases, in which there were 248 cases each in the experimental and control groups, respectively. The baseline profiles of the subjects included in the studies were comparable. The basic information of the included studies is shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Basic characteristics of the included literatures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Included studies</th>
<th>Study design</th>
<th>Sample size (cases)</th>
<th>Age (years)</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wang Xiaocui, 2020</td>
<td>Random number table</td>
<td>29 29</td>
<td>32.58 ± 3.44 31.74 ± 2.06</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue prescription on the basis of the treatment given to the control group</td>
<td>Luteal support therapy ①23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chen Ying, 2020</td>
<td>Random number table</td>
<td>30 30</td>
<td>30.50 ± 3.74 30.63 ± 3.25</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue herbs</td>
<td>Low molecular heparin sodium ①34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chen Chun, 2018</td>
<td>Random method</td>
<td>48 48</td>
<td>29.51 ± 1.85 29.44 ± 1.64</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue prescription on the basis of the treatment given to the control group</td>
<td>Progesterone + chorionic gonadotropin + low molecular heparin calcium ①23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li Juxian, 2017</td>
<td>Random number table</td>
<td>45 45</td>
<td>32.14 ± 4.63 31.85 ± 5.72</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue prescription on the basis of the treatment given to the control group</td>
<td>Low molecular heparin calcium ③</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yao Yao, 2019</td>
<td>Random method</td>
<td>30 30</td>
<td>29.3 28.8</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue prescription</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu Yuxin, 2021</td>
<td>Random method</td>
<td>30 30</td>
<td>30.91 ± 5.47 30.45 ± 5.66</td>
<td>Bushen Huoxue decoction on the basis of the treatment given to the control group</td>
<td>Low molecular heparin ①34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xu Chunyue, 2020</td>
<td>Random number table</td>
<td>36 36</td>
<td>30.0 ± 4.1    28.9 ± 4.3</td>
<td>Jiawei Shoutai Pill on the basis of the treatment given to the control group</td>
<td>Low molecular heparin sodium ②34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: E: experimental group; C: control group; ① total clinical efficiency; ② embryonic survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation; ③ D-dimer; ④ Fib; ⑤ incidence of adverse reactions

3.3. Evaluation of the methodological quality of the included studies

Among the included studies, four studies [17,18,20,23] grouped the patients by the random number table method and were rated as low risk, two studies [19,21] grouped the patients by the random method only and did not specify any specific method, thus rated as unclear risk, and a study [22] that randomized according to the patients’ wishes was rated as high risk. None of the studies mentioned concealment grouping and were rated as unclear risk. In regard to implementation bias, all seven studies did not mention any kind of blinding.
method and were rated as unclear risk. In regard to outcome evaluation bias, all seven studies did not mention whether the outcome evaluators were blinded and were rated as unclear risk. In regard to outcome data completeness, all seven studies did not find any missing outcome data and were rated as low risk. In regard to selective publication, one study [21] was missing pre-defined observation “pregnancy rate” and was rated as high risk. In regard to other bias, none of the seven studies could determine whether there were other factors contributing to bias, and all were rated as unclear risk (Figure 2).

Figure 2. The literatures are included in the quality evaluation map

3.4. Meta-analysis results
3.4.1. Total clinical efficiency
Four studies [17-19, 22] reported the total clinical efficiency, in which there were 137 cases each in the experimental and control groups, respectively. The total efficiency was analyzed by combining cure, apparent effect, and effective [17,19]; cure and improved [18]; as well as cure and apparent effect [22] as the count data. As there was no heterogeneity among the four studies ($P = 0.76$, $I^2 = 0\%$), a fixed-effects model was used for analysis. The results showed statistically significant differences between the two groups [$RR = 1.22$, $95\% CI (1.10, 1.35)$, $Z = 3.80$ ($P = 0.0001$)], suggesting that the total clinical efficiency of patients with RSA due to PTA treated with tonics or tonics in combination with western medicine is superior to that of western medicine only (Figure 3).

Figure 3. Comparison of total clinical efficacy between the experimental group and the control group

3.4.2. Embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation
Four studies [17,19,20,23] reported the effect of Bushen Huoxue prescription on embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation, in which there were 158 cases each in the experimental and control groups, respectively. As there was no heterogeneity among the four studies ($P = 0.99$, $I^2 = 0\%$), a fixed-effects model was used for analysis. The results showed statistically significant differences between the two groups [$RR = 1.25$,
95% CI (1.10, 1.41), Z = 3.53 (P = 0.004), suggesting that the embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation in RSA patients with PTA treated with western medicine in combination with kidney tonics and blood invigorating formulae is superior to that of western medicine alone (Figure 4).

![Figure 4. Comparison of embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation between the experimental group and the control group](image)

3.4.3. D-dimer value

All seven studies [17-23] reported the effect of Bushen Huoxue prescription on D-dimer values, with 218 cases each in the experimental and control groups, respectively. In view of the large heterogeneity among the seven studies (P < 0.00001, I² = 89%), a random-effects model was used for analysis. The results showed statistically significant difference [SMD = -1.59, 95% CI (-2.20, -0.97), Z = 5.07 (P < 0.00001)], suggesting that the treatment using either Bushen Huoxue prescription or Bushen Huoxue prescription combined with western medicine in RSA patients with PTA is superior to western medicine alone in reducing D-dimer values (Figure 5).

![Figure 5. Comparison of D-dimer values at gestation between the experimental group and the control group](image)

3.4.4. Fibrinogen (Fib) value

The effect of Bushen Huoxue prescription on fibrinogen values was reported in 6 studies [17-20, 22, 23], with 218 cases each in the experimental and control groups, respectively. In view of the large heterogeneity among the 7 studies (P < 0.00001, I² = 96%), a random-effects model was used for analysis. The results showed statistically significant difference [MD = -1.00, 95% CI (-1.29, -0.70), Z = 6.61 (P < 0.00001)], suggesting that the treatment with either Bushen Huoxue prescription or Bushen Huoxue prescription combined with western medicine is superior to that of western medicine alone in reducing Fib levels (Figure 6).
3.4.5. Incidence of adverse reactions

Only one study [22] reported the incidence of adverse reactions. There were two events of adverse reactions in the experimental group within a sample size of 30, whereas there were five events of adverse reactions in the control group within a sample size of 30. The results showed no statistically significant difference in the incidence of adverse reactions between the treatment with Bushen Huoxue prescription combined with western medicine and western medicine alone [RR = 0.36, 95% CI (0.06, 2.01), Z = 1.17 (P = 0.24)] (Figure 7).

3.5. Sensitivity analysis

Sensitivity analysis was performed by excluding the included studies one by one. For those with less statistical heterogeneity, such as total clinical efficiency and embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation, the results were not significantly different after changing the effect size, thus suggesting stable statistical results; for those with greater heterogeneity, the effect values remained highly heterogeneous with respect to D-dimer value, FIB value, and uterine artery flow resistance after excluding the included studies on a case-by-case basis.

4. Discussion

In traditional Chinese medicine, kidney deficiency is considered as the key etiological mechanism of RSA. Research has found that kidney deficiency accounts for 89.1% of the TCM symptoms in RSA patients [24], which shows that kidney deficiency syndrome is the main type of RSA. Researchers have suggested that the main pathogenesis of RSA in patients with PTS is kidney deficiency and blood stasis [25]. Therefore, the treatment of RSA patients with PTS by Bushen Huoxue method has rationality.

The results of this meta-analysis showed that compared with the use of western medicine alone, Bushen Huoxue prescription alone or in combination with western medicine has significant advantages in improving the overall clinical efficiency, embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation, and reducing D-dimer value as well as FIB value, without statistically significant differences in the incidence of adverse effects. After excluding the literatures, there was still a high degree of heterogeneity, considering the following possible reasons: (1) the herbal medicines used were not identical among the studies, and there
were differences in the dosage and duration; (2) there may be differences in baseline levels, such as the duration of illness, number of miscarriages, D-dimer values, Fib values, and the time of index testing when comparing the samples of the studies horizontally; (3) the quality of the included studies was poor, and the design was less rigorous in terms of implementation bias and measurement bias.

The limitations of this study include the following: (1) the number of included RCTs was small and the sample size of each study was small; (2) only one study had data on adverse reactions \[22\]; thus, there is insufficient evidence to support the safety of the use of Bushen Huoxue method for this disease; (3) the quality of the study was poor as the studies did not elaborate on their sample size calculation process, and in terms of methodology, there was a lack of rigorous random sequence concealment, double-blinding of the subjects and healthcare providers, as well as outcome evaluator-blinded design; (4) the included studies were all published, and there is a possibility of missing out negative findings.

5. Conclusion
Compared with western treatment, the treatment of RSA patients with PTS by Bushen Huoxue method has obvious advantages in improving the overall clinical efficiency, embryo survival rate at 12 weeks of gestation, and reducing D-dimer value as well as Fib value; thus, worthy of clinical reference. When conducting RCTs in the future, the determination of sample size needs to be based on a rigorous calculation process, the design of trial methodology should be standardized, and the completeness of outcome indicators should be noted in outcome reporting to improve the credibility of the conclusion as well as provide a reliable basis for the effectiveness and safety of TCM treatment in reducing the incidence of RSA due to PTS.

Funding
National Natural Science Foundation of China Project (Project Number: 81603656); Shaanxi University of Traditional Chinese Medicine 2017 Annual Scientific Research Program Project (Project Number: 2017PY10); Infertility Innovation Team (Project Number: 132041929).

Disclosure statement
The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References


Publisher’s note
Bio-Byword Scientific Publishing remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.